

IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS  
FRANKLIN COUNTY, OHIO

STATE OF OHIO, ex rel. )  
MICHAEL DEWINE )  
Attorney General of Ohio )  
30 East Broad Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor )  
Columbus, Ohio 43215 )

CASE NO.

JUDGE

PLAINTIFF, )

COMPLAINT AND  
REQUEST FOR INJUNCTIVE AND  
DECLARATORY RELIEF,  
CONSUMER RESTITUTION, AND  
CIVIL PENALTIES

v. )

GEORGE ELLISH JR. )  
5300 Trabue Road )  
Columbus, OH 43228 )

and )

IX CREATIONS )  
c/o Alex Hastie, Registered Agent )  
1192 Grandview Ave. )  
Grandview Heights, OH 43212 )

DEFENDANTS. )

JURISDICTION

1. Plaintiff, State of Ohio, by and through the Attorney General of Ohio, Michael DeWine, having reasonable cause to believe that violations of Ohio’s consumer laws have occurred, brings this action in the public interest and on behalf of the State of Ohio under the authority vested in him by R.C. 1345.07.
2. The actions of Defendants, George Elish Jr. and IX Creations, as described below, have occurred in Franklin County and, as set forth below, are in violation of the Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq. and the Substantive Rules, OAC 109:4-3-01 et seq.
3. Defendants, as described below, are “suppliers” as that term is defined in R.C. 1345.01(C), as the Defendants were, at all times relevant herein, engaged in the business of effecting consumer transactions by soliciting and selling home improvement repairs

and services to individuals in several counties throughout Ohio, including Franklin County, for purposes that were primarily personal, family or household within the meaning specified in R.C. 1345.01(A) and (D).

4. Jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action lies with this Court pursuant to R.C. 1345.04 of the Consumer Sales Practices Act.
5. This Court has venue to hear this case pursuant to Ohio Civ. R. 3 (B)(2), in that Franklin County is the location in which the Defendants had their principal place of business.

### **THE DEFENDANTS**

6. Defendant, George Elish Jr. (hereafter Defendant Elish), is an individual who is last known to have operated his business at 5300 Trabue Road, Columbus, OH 43228.
7. Defendant Elish registered Defendant IX Creations as a domestic limited liability company on September 2, 2009.
8. Defendant Elish directed, supervised, approved, formulated, authorized, ratified, benefited from and/or otherwise participated in the day to day activities of the business entity known as Defendant IX Creations.
9. Defendant Elish operated, dominated, controlled, and directed the business activities of Defendant IX Creations, causing, personally participating in, and/or ratifying the acts and practices of Defendant IX Creations as described in this Complaint.

### **STATEMENT OF FACTS**

10. Defendants, at all times relevant to this action, engaged in the selling of consumer goods or services, specifically home improvement repairs or services.
11. Defendants contracted to provide home improvement repairs or services to consumers in their residential homes.
12. At the time of the transactions, Defendants met at the consumers' homes to provide an estimate for the repairs or services needed in consumers' residential homes.

13. At the time of the transactions, or prior to any work being completed, Defendants failed to provide consumers with a written form which included language explaining the consumer's right to a written estimate.
14. At the time of the transactions, or prior to any work being completed, Defendants failed to provide consumers with a written form that indicated the reasonably anticipated completion date.
15. At the time of the transaction, or prior to any work being completed, Defendants failed to provide consumers with a list of the parts or materials, the amount charged for labor, and the identity of individuals performing the repair or service.
16. Defendants accepted down payments from consumers for the purchase of services, and then failed to deliver the services for which the consumers paid.
17. After the Defendants accepted down payments and failed to deliver services, Defendants failed to refund the down payments to consumers.
18. When the Defendants performed work for consumers, the work was performed in an incomplete, shoddy, or unworkmanlike manner.

**PLAINTIFF'S FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION:**  
**VIOLATIONS OF THE CONSUMER SALES PRACTICES ACT**

**COUNT ONE**  
**FAILURE TO DELIVER VIOLATION**

19. Plaintiff incorporates by reference, as if completely rewritten herein, the allegations set forth in Paragraphs one through eighteen (1-18) of this Complaint.
20. Defendants committed unfair and deceptive acts and practices in violation of R.C. 1345.02 and Ohio Adm. Code 109:4-3-09(A)(2) by accepting money from consumers for home improvement services and permitting eight weeks to elapse without delivering the contracted services or making a full refund.

21. The acts and practices described in the paragraph above have been previously determined by Ohio courts to violate the Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq. Defendants committed said violations after such decisions were available for public inspection.

**COUNT TWO**  
**PERFORMING WORK IN A SHODDY OR UNWORKMANLIKE MANNER**

22. Plaintiff incorporates by reference, as if completely rewritten herein, the allegations set forth in Paragraphs one through eighteen (1-18) of this Complaint.
23. Defendants committed unfair or deceptive acts or practices in violation of R.C. 1345.02(A) by performing home repair or improvement services in an incomplete, shoddy, or unworkmanlike manner.
24. The acts and practices described in the paragraph above have been previously determined by Ohio courts to violate the Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq. Defendants committed said violations after such decisions were available for public inspection.

**COUNT THREE**  
**FAILURE TO PROVIDE ESTIMATE CHOICE LANGUAGE**

25. Plaintiff incorporates by reference, as if completely rewritten herein, the allegations set forth in Paragraphs one through eighteen (1-18) of this Complaint.
26. Defendants committed unfair or deceptive acts or practices in violation of R.C. 1345.02(A) and Ohio Adm. Code 109:4-3-05(A) by failing to provide the consumer with a written estimate choice language form at the time of the initial face to face contact or prior to the commencement of any repair or service, and by failing to provide the consumer with a form that indicated the reasonably anticipated completion date.
27. Defendants committed unfair and deceptive acts or practices in violation of R.C. 1345.02(A) and Ohio Adm. Code 109:4-3-05(D) by failing to provide the consumer with a

list of parts or materials, the amount charged for labor, and the identity of the individuals performing the repair or service.

28. The acts and practices described in the paragraphs above have been previously determined by Ohio courts to violate the Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq. Defendants committed said violations after such decisions were available for public inspection.

**PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests this Court to:

- A. ISSUE a permanent injunction enjoining Defendants, their agents, servants, representatives, salesmen, employees, successors, or assigns, and all persons acting in concert and participation with them from further violating the Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq., and the substantive rules of the Ohio Administrative Code.
- B. ISSUE a declaratory judgment declaring that each act or practice described in Plaintiff's Complaint violates the Consumer Sales Practices Act, as set forth herein.
- C. ASSESS, FINE, AND IMPOSE upon Defendants, a civil penalty of Twenty Five Thousand Dollars (\$25,000.00) for each appropriate violation described herein, pursuant to R.C. 1345.07(D), for which Defendants shall be jointly and severally liable.
- D. AWARD a monetary judgment against Defendants in an amount sufficient to reimburse all consumers found to have been damaged by the Defendants' unfair and deceptive acts and practices.
- E. ISSUE an Injunction prohibiting Defendants from engaging in business as a supplier in any consumer transaction in the State of Ohio until such time as they have satisfied all monetary obligations ordered by this Court, and any other Court in Ohio in connection with a consumer transaction.
- F. GRANT the Ohio Attorney General his costs in bringing this action.

- G. GRANT such other relief as the Court deems to be just, equitable, and appropriate.
- H. ORDER Defendants to jointly and severally pay all court costs.

Respectfully submitted,

MICHAEL DEWINE  
Ohio Attorney General

*/s/ Kate E. Christobek*  
KATE E. CHRISTOBEK (0088746)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection Section  
30 East Broad Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-466-3493 (phone)  
877-629-2622 (fax)  
Kate.Christobek@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Plaintiff*