



Ohio Attorney General's Office  
Bureau of Criminal Investigation  
Investigative Report



2023-1792  
Officer Involved Critical Incident – I-70 at Mound Street,  
Columbus, OH

**Investigative Activity:** Document Review  
**Date of Activity:** 10/04/2023  
**Author:** SA James A. Mulford, #39

**Narrative:**

On August 22, 2023, SA Mulford received a BCI Firearms Laboratory Report for BCI Lab# 23-16470. Please refer to the BCI Lab report for further clarification and details. The findings were saved electronically within the case file and are attached to this report.

Multiple firearms, cartridge casings, and bullets were submitted to the Lab. Forensic Scientist Mathew White identified nine (9) 9mm Cartridge cases and one fired bullet as being source identified to the operable, non-law enforcement, Glock 9mm Luger Semi-automatic pistol (ZLB578) located at the scene. All other related firearms submitted evidence was source identified to the known law enforcement firearms.

Item # 54 (fired projectile recovered from the body of Officer [REDACTED] was source identified to the non-law enforcement Glock 9mm Luger Semi-automatic pistol (ZLB578) located at the scene.

Some of item #56 (multiple projectiles and fragments collected during the autopsy of Abdisamad Ismail) were source identified to S&W Pistol ([REDACTED] issued to CPD Officer [REDACTED] and S&W Pistol ([REDACTED] issued to CPD Officer [REDACTED]. The rest of the items were deemed insufficient for comparison.

**Attachments:**

Attachment # 01: BCI Firearms Lab Report 23.16470



# DAVE YOST

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

**Bureau of Criminal Investigation**

**Laboratory Report  
Firearms**

To:	BCI / Madison Jim Mulford 1560 S.R. 56 SW London, OH 43140	BCI Laboratory Number:	23-16470
		Analysis Date:	Issue Date: August 15, 2023
		Agency Case Number:	2023-1792
Offense:	Shooting Involving an Officer	BCI Agent:	Amy Gill
Subject(s):	- N/A -		
Victim(s):	- N/A -		

**Submitted on July 07, 2023 by Amy Gill:**

1. One manila envelope containing fired projectiles from Jeep Cherokee (BCI #1, Scene #1)
2. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #1, Scene #1)  
- seven (7) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
3. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #2, Scene #1)  
- two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
4. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #3, Scene #1)  
- four (4) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
5. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #4, Scene #1)  
- eight (8) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
6. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #5, Scene #1)  
- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
7. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #6, Scene #1)  
- six (6) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
8. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #7, Scene #1)  
- four (4) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
9. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #8, Scene #1)  
- nine (9) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases
10. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #9, Scene #1)  
- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases

Please address inquiries to the office indicated, using the BCI case number.

BCI -Bowling Green Office  
750 North College Drive  
Bowling Green, OH 43402  
Phone:(419)353-5603

BCI -London Office  
1560 St Rt 56 SW P.O. Box 365  
London, OH 43140  
Phone:(740)845-2000

BCI -Richfield Office  
4055 Highlander Pkwy. Suite A  
Richfield, OH 44286  
Phone:(330)659-4600



11. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #10, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
12. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #12, Scene #1)  
*- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
13. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #14, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
14. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #15, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
15. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #16, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
16. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #18, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
17. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #19, Scene #1)  
*- two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
18. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #20, Scene #1)  
*- five (5) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
19. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #21, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
20. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #22, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
21. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #23, Scene #1)  
*- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
22. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with light and magazine (BCI #24, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]*  
*- one (1) magazine*
23. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #25, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
24. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #26, Scene #1)  
*- five (5) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
25. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #28, Scene #1)  
*- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
26. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #30, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) 9mm Luger cartridge*
27. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #31, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
28. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #32, Scene #1)  
*- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
29. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #33, Scene #1)  
*- three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
30. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #34, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
31. One manila envelope containing fired projectile on roadway (BCI #35, Scene #1)
32. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #36, Scene #1)  
*- one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*

33. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #37, Scene #1)  
- *six (6) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
34. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #38, Scene #1)  
- *eight (8) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
35. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #40, Scene #1)  
- *two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
36. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases from roadway (BCI #41, Scene #1)  
- *four (4) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
37. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case from roadway (BCI #42, Scene #1)  
- *one (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case*
38. One manila envelope containing fired projectile on roadway (BCI #44, Scene #1)
39. One manila envelope containing fired projectile on roadway (BCI #45, Scene #1)
40. One manila envelope containing fired projectile on roadway (BCI #46, Scene #1)
41. One manila envelope containing fired cartridge cases on back trunk of Chevy Malibu HDG6364 (BCI #48, Scene #1)  
- *two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases*
42. One manila envelope containing fired projectile from Port A John (BCI #50, Scene #1)
43. One manila envelope containing fired projectile from roadway (BCI #51, Scene #1)
44. One manila envelope containing fired projectile from cruiser [REDACTED] front headliner (BCI #57, Scene #1)
45. One cardboard box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED]) with magazine and cartridges (BCI #58, Scene #1)
46. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazine and cartridges (BCI #1, Scene #2)  
- *one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]*  
- *one (1) magazine*  
- *seventeen (17) 9mm Luger cartridges*
47. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazine and cartridges (BCI #2, Scene #2)  
- *one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]*  
- *one (1) magazine*  
- *seventeen (17) 9mm Luger cartridges*
48. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazine and cartridges (BCI #3, Scene #2)  
- *one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]*  
- *one (1) magazine*  
- *five (5) 9mm Luger cartridges*
49. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazines and cartridges (BCI #4, Scene #2)  
- *one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]*  
- *two (2) magazines*  
- *twenty-eight (28) 9mm Luger cartridges*

50. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazines and cartridges (BCI #5, Scene #2)
  - one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]
  - two (2) magazines
  - twenty (20) 9mm Luger cartridges
51. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazine and cartridges (BCI #6, Scene #2)
  - one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]
  - one (1) magazine
  - fourteen (14) 9mm Luger cartridges
52. White box containing firearm (serial # [REDACTED] with magazine and cartridges (BCI #7, Scene #2)
  - one (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED]
  - one (1) magazine
  - thirteen (13) 9mm Luger cartridges
53. White box containing firearm (serial #ZLB578) with magazine and cartridges (BCI #1, Scene #3)
  - one (1) Glock model 17 Gen4, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number ZLB578
  - one (1) magazine
  - nineteen (19) 9mm Luger cartridges
54. Brown paper bag containing fired projectile from the body of Officer [REDACTED] (BCI #2, Scene #3)
  - one (1) fired bullet

**Submitted on July 12, 2023 by Amy Gill:**

56. Brown paper bag containing projectiles and fragments (Scene 4, item#7)
  - seven (7) fired bullets
  - four (4) fired bullet jacket fragments
  - two (2) lead fragments
  - four (4) bullet fragments
  - one (1) circular piece of fabric
  - one (1) copper / lead fragment

**Submitted on July 20, 2023 by Amy Gill:**

57. One manila envelope containing cartridge casing BCI #59 scene 1
  - three (3) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases

**Findings**

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#53: Glock pistol (ZLB578)	N/A	Operable
	#16, #19, #20, #28, #29: nine (9) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	#54: one (1) fired bullet	

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#22: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable (see remarks)
	#11, #14, #17, #18, #23, #24, #25, #57: twenty-one (21) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	#56: five (5) fired bullets	
#22 (removed from damaged area on magazine): one (1) copper fragment one (1) lead fragment	N/A	Unsuitable^

^Insufficient class and/or individual characteristics present.

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#46: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#2, #4, #5, #6: eighteen (18) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#47: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#2, #3, #4, #7, #8, #12, #13, #21, #27: eighteen (18) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#48: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#33, #34: thirteen (13) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#49: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#35, #36, #37: seven (7) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#50: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#8, #9, #10: fifteen (15) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	#56: two (2) fired bullets	

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#51: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#15, #30, #32, #33: four (4) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#52: S&W pistol (████████)	N/A	Operable
	#2, #5, #12, #41: five (5) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#56: four (4) fired bullet jacket fragments two (2) lead fragments four (4) bullet fragments one (1) circular piece of fabric one (1) copper / lead fragment	N/A	Unsuitable^

^Insufficient class and/or individual characteristics present.

**Remarks**

The S&W pistol magazine, item #22, has damage present on the right side (indentation / perforation of the magazine body). One (1) copper and one (1) lead fragment were removed from the damage.

A test fired cartridge case from item #53 was previously entered and searched in the NIBIN database at the London laboratory. If investigative information becomes available, your agency will be notified.

- Six (6) of the seventeen (17) submitted cartridges from item #46 were used for test firing.
- Six (6) of the seventeen (17) submitted cartridges from item #47 were used for test firing.
- Five (5) of the five (5) submitted cartridges from item #48 were used for test firing.
- Six (6) of the twenty-eight (28) submitted cartridges from item #49 were used for test firing.
- Six (6) of the twenty (20) submitted cartridges from item #50 were used for test firing.
- Six (6) of the fourteen (14) submitted cartridges from item #51 were used for test firing.
- Six (6) of the thirteen (13) submitted cartridges from item #52 were used for test firing.
- Six (6) of the nineteen (19) submitted cartridges from item #53 were used for test firing.

The remaining submitted items from items #1, #26, #31, #38, #39, #40, #42, #43, #44, #45, #46, #47, #49, #50, #51, #52, and #53 were not examined / compared at this time.

All evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

**Analytical Detail**

Analytical findings offered above were determined using visual and microscopic examinations / comparisons.



Matthew White  
Forensic Scientist  
(740) 845-2528  
matthew.white@OhioAGO.gov



Based on scientific analyses performed, this report contains opinions and interpretations by the analyst whose signature appears above. Examination documentation and any demonstrative data supporting laboratory conclusions are maintained by BCI and will be made available for review upon request.

Your feedback is important to us! Please complete our Laboratory Satisfaction Survey at: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Q7V2N6H>



### Comparison Conclusion Scale

The following lists the conclusions a Forensic Scientist may reach when performing comparisons. In reaching a conclusion, a Forensic Scientist considers the similarities and dissimilarities and assesses the relative support of the observations under the following two propositions: the evidence originated from the same source or from a different source.

A Forensic Scientist may utilize their knowledge, training, and experience to evaluate how much support the observed similarities or dissimilarities provide for one conclusion over another. A conclusion shall not be communicated with absolute certainty. It is an interpretation of observations made by the Forensic Scientists and shall be expressed as an expert opinion.

1	Source Identification	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from a different source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility.
2	Support for Same Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source rather than different sources; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Identification. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
3	Inconclusive	The observations do not provide a sufficient degree of support for one proposition over the other. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
4	Support for Different Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from different sources rather than the same source; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Exclusion. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
5	Source Exclusion	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from a different source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from the same source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility; or the evidence exhibits fundamentally different characteristics

We invite you to direct your questions to:  
Abby Schwaderer, Quality Assurance Manager  
(740) 845-2517  
[abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)