



Ohio Attorney General's Office
Bureau of Criminal Investigation
Investigative Report



2024-1755
Officer Involved Critical Incident - 4500 Block of Sullivant
Ave, Columbus, OH (L)

Investigative Activity: Records Received; Document Review
Involves: CPD [REDACTED]
Activity Date: 02/13/2025
Activity Location: BCI
Authoring Agent: SA Matthew Collins

Narrative:

On Thursday, February 13, 2025, Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI) Special Agent (SA) Matt Collins (SA Collins) received Ohio BCI Laboratory report(s) for items of evidence submitted on June 26, 2020 for scientific analysis (laboratory case number 24-15291). The report originated from the Firearms section of the Laboratory and was authored by Forensic Scientist Krystal Soles. The items relevant to this report which had previously been submitted were as follows:

1. Multiple fired cartridge casings and fired bullets (see lap report for complete list)
2. Multiple rifle and handguns

SA Collins reviewed the laboratory report and noted the following:

The above-mentioned casings and fired bullets were compared to the rifle and handguns possessed by officers. Those findings were as follows:

1. Item #10- Daniel Defense Rifle (Ser# [REDACTED])
 - a. This gun was possessed by CPD [REDACTED]
 - b. The gun was found to be operable
 - c. The gun was linked (source ident.) to Item #15 (EB9, EB12)
 - i. Two (2) fired bullets- Collected at autopsy
 - d. The gun was linked (source ident.) to Item #2 (EC4-EC6)
 - i. Six (6) fired 223 Rem cases- Collected from the scene
2. Item #11- Daniel Defense Rifle (Ser# [REDACTED])
 - a. This gun was possessed by CPD [REDACTED]
 - b. The gun was found to be operable
 - c. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #2 (EC1-EC3)
 - i. Three (3) fired 223 Rem cases- Collected from the scene
3. Item #12- Smith and Wesson pistol (Ser# [REDACTED])

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law - a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.



Ohio Attorney General's Office
Bureau of Criminal Investigation
Investigative Report



2024-1755

Officer Involved Critical Incident - 4500 Block of Sullivant
Ave, Columbus, OH (L)

- a. This gun was found to be operable
- b. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #1 (EC1-EC2); Item #4 (EC1-EC5); Item #5 (EC2), and Item #9 (EC1)
 - i. These were nine (9) fired 9mm cases- Collected from the scene
- c. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #7, Item #8
 - i. Two (2) fired bullets- Collected at the scene
- d. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #15 (EB3-EB5, EB7)
 - i. Six (6) fired bullets- Collected from Autopsy
4. Item #13- Smith and Wesson pistol (Ser# [REDACTED])
 - a. This gun was possessed by CPD [REDACTED]
 - b. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #6 (EC1, EC3-EC5)
 - i. Four (4) fired 9mm cases- Collected from the scene
 - c. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #15 (EB1, EB6, EB8)
 - i. Three (3) fired bullets- Collected from Autopsy
5. Item #14- Smith and Wesson pistol ([REDACTED])
 - a. This gun was possessed by CPD [REDACTED]
 - b. The gun was linked (source ident) to Item #5 (EC1) and Item #6 (EC2)
 - i. Two (2) fired 9mm cases- Collected from the scene

Other noteworthy details was Item #15 (EB2), a fired bullet recovered at autopsy was inconclusive in source identification. However, it was consistent with being fired from a 9mm luger or likely one of the three S&W pistols. The other lead fragments collected at autopsy were unsuitable for comparison to any of the weapons mentioned above.

A copy of the Ohio BCI Laboratory report is attached to this investigative report. Please refer to the attachment for further details.

References:

None

Attachments:

- 1- FA_Lab Report 24-15291

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law - a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.



DAVE YOST

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Bureau of Criminal Investigation

**Laboratory Report
Firearms**

To: BCI / Madison
SA MATT COLLINS
1560 S.R. 56 SW
London, OH 43140

BCI Laboratory Number: 24-15291

Analysis Date:
July 01, 2024

Issue Date:
August 20, 2024

Agency Case Number: 2024-1755
BCI Agent: Aja Chung

Offense: Shooting Involving an Officer
Subject(s): N/A
Victim(s): N/A

Submitted on 06/12/2024 by Aja Chung

1. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 2, scene 1)
- **Two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases. (1EC1-1EC2)**
2. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 3, scene 1)
- **Six (6) fired 223 Rem cartridge cases. (2EC1-2EC6)**
3. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 4, Scene 1)
- **Three (3) fired 223 Rem cartridge cases. (3EC1-3EC3)**
4. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 5, scene 1)
- **Five (5) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases. (4EC1-4EC5)**
5. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 7, scene 1)
- **Two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases. (5EC1-5EC2)**
6. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 8, scene 1)
- **Five (5) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases. (6EC1-6EC5)**
7. One manila envelope containing projectile (BCI 10, scene 1)
- **One (1) fired bullet. (7EB1)**
8. One manila envelope containing projectile (BCI 11, scene 1)
- **One (1) fired bullet. (8EB1)**
9. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (BCI 12, scene 1)
- **One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case. (9EC1)**

Please address inquiries to the office indicated, using the BCI case number.

BCI -Bowling Green Office
750 North College Drive
Bowling Green, OH 43402
Phone:(419)353-5603

BCI -London Office
1560 St Rt 56 SW P.O. Box 365
London, OH 43140
Phone:(740)845-2000

BCI -Richfield Office
4055 Highlander Pkwy. Suite A
Richfield, OH 44286
Phone:(330)659-4600

10. One cardboard box containing firearm (serial [REDACTED]) with magazine and cartridges (BCI 13, scene 1)
 - One (1) Daniel Defense model DDM4 V7, 5.56mm semi-automatic rifle, serial number [REDACTED] with one (1) magazine and twenty-six (26) unfired 223 Rem cartridges.
11. One cardboard box containing firearm (serial [REDACTED]) with magazine and cartridges (BCI 14, scene 1)
 - One (1) Daniel Defense model DDM4 V7, 5.56mm semi-automatic rifle, serial number [REDACTED] with one (1) magazine and twenty-seven (27) unfired 223 Rem cartridges.
12. White box containing firearm (serial [REDACTED]) with magazine and cartridges (BCI 1, scene 2)
 - One (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED] with one (1) magazine and nine (9) unfired 9mm Luger cartridges.
13. White box containing firearm (serial [REDACTED]) with magazine and cartridges (BCI 2, scene 2)
 - One (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED] with one (1) magazine and eleven (11) unfired 9mm Luger cartridges.
14. White box containing firearm (serial [REDACTED]) with magazine (BCI 3, scene 2)
 - One (1) Smith & Wesson model M&P 9 M2.0, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, serial number [REDACTED] with one (1) magazine and sixteen (16) unfired 9mm Luger cartridges.

Submitted on 06/26/2024 by Amy Gill

15. Brown paper bag containing fired projectile (BCI item 9, Scene #4)
 - **Ten (10) fired bullets (15EB1-15EB9, EB12)**
Fifteen (15) jacket fragments (15EB10, 15EB13-15EB16, 15EB18-15EB24, 15EB-26-15EB28)
Six (6) lead fragments (15EB11, 15EB17, 15EB25)

Findings

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 10: Daniel Defense rifle SN: [REDACTED]	N/A	Operable
	Item 15 (15EB9, 15EB12): two (2) fired bullets	Source Identification
	Item 2 (2EC4-2EC6) and item 3 (3EC1-3EC3): six (6) fired 223 Rem cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 11: Daniel Defense rifle SN: [REDACTED]	N/A	Operable
	Item 2 (2EC1-2EC3): three (3) fired 223 Rem cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 12: Smith & Wesson pistol (SN: ██████████)	N/A	Operable
	Item 1 (1EC1 - 1EC2), item 4 (4EC1 - 4EC5), item 5 (5EC2), and item 9 (9EC1): nine (9) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	Item 7, item 8, and item 15 (15EB3-15EB5, 15EB7): six (6) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 13: Smith & Wesson pistol (SN: ██████████)	Item 6 (6EC1, 6EC3-6EC5): four (4) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	Item 15 (15EB1, 15EB6, 15EB8): three (3) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 14: Smith & Wesson pistol (SN: ██████████)	item 5 (5EC1) and item 6 (6EC2): two (2) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 15 (15EB2): one (1) fired bullet	N/A	Most consistent with 9MM Luger
	Item 12: Smith & Wesson pistol (SN: ██████████)	Inconclusive*
	Item 13: Smith & Wesson pistol (SN: ██████████)	Inconclusive*
	Item 14: Smith & Wesson pistol (SN: ██████████)	Inconclusive*

*Similar class characteristics but insufficient corresponding individual characteristics to identify or exclude.

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item 15 (15EB11, 15EB17, 15EB25): Lead fragments	N/A	Unsuitable^

^Insufficient class and/or individual characteristics present.

Remarks

Six (6) of the nine (9) submitted cartridges from Item 12 were used for test firing.

Six (6) of the eleven (11) submitted cartridges from Item 13 were used for test firing.

Six (6) of the sixteen (16) submitted cartridges from Item 14 were used for test firing.

The remaining submitted items from Items 10, 11, 12, 13, 14 & 15 were not examined/compared at this time.

All evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Analytical Detail

Analytical findings offered above were determined using visual and microscopic examinations / comparisons.



Krystal Soles
Forensic Scientist
(740) 845-2127
Krystal.Soles@OhioAGO.gov



Based on scientific analyses performed, this report contains opinions and interpretations by the analyst whose signature appears above. Examination documentation and any demonstrative data supporting laboratory conclusions are maintained by BCI and will be made available for review upon request. Results relate only to the items tested.

Your feedback is important to us! Please complete our Laboratory Satisfaction Survey at: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Q7V2N6H>

Comparison Conclusion Scale

The following lists the conclusions a Forensic Scientist may reach when performing comparisons. In reaching a conclusion, a Forensic Scientist considers the similarities and dissimilarities and assesses the relative support of the observations under the following two propositions: the evidence originated from the same source or from a different source.

A Forensic Scientist may utilize their knowledge, training, and experience to evaluate how much support the observed similarities or dissimilarities provide for one conclusion over another. A conclusion shall not be communicated with absolute certainty. It is an interpretation of observations made by the Forensic Scientists and shall be expressed as an expert opinion.

1	Source Identification	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from a different source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility.
2	Support for Same Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source rather than different sources; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Identification. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
3	Inconclusive	The observations do not provide a sufficient degree of support for one proposition over the other. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
4	Support for Different Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from different sources rather than the same source; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Exclusion. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
5	Source Exclusion	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from a different source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from the same source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility; or the evidence exhibits fundamentally different characteristics

We invite you to direct your questions to:
Abby Schwaderer, Quality Assurance Manager
(740) 845-2517
abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Krystal Soles
Statement of Qualifications
Krystal.Soles@OhioAGO.gov

Education

- Bachelor of Science in Forensic Science. May 2009. Waynesburg University. Waynesburg, Pennsylvania
- Continuing and Professional Education Certificate in Introduction to Firearms and Toolmarks. April 2017. West Virginia University. Morgantown, West Virginia.

Professional Experience

- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Forensic Scientist, Firearms. October 2022-March 2024.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Forensic Scientist, Drug Chemistry. March 2018-October 2022.
- Ohio State Highway Patrol. Criminalist, Drug Chemistry. May 2015-Present.
- Pace Analytical Service, Inc. Laboratory Analyst, Wet Chemistry. June 2012-April 2015.
- U.S. Micro Solutions, Inc. Laboratory Technician. October 2011-June 2012.
- Investigations by King, LLC. Private Investigator. December 2010-May 2011.
- Allegheny County Medical Examiner. Forensic Investigator Intern. May 2008-August 2008.

Selected Specialized Training

- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Firearms Training. 2022-2024.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Drug Chemistry Training. 2018.

A complete CV can be made available upon request
Updated 03/14/2024