

Ohio Attorney General's Office Bureau of Criminal Investigation Investigative Report



2023-0408 Officer Involved Critical Incident - 1680 Stringtown Rd., Grove City 43123 (L)

Investigative Activity:	Document Review, Records Received
Date of Activity:	02/28/2023
Author:	SA Kyle Douglass, #126

Narrative:

On February 28, 2023 and March 16, 2023, Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI) Special Agent Kyle Douglass (SA Douglass) received BCI Firearms Laboratory Reports for BCI Lab #23–11636. Please refer to the BCI Lab report for further clarification and details. The findings were saved electronically within the case file and are attached to this report.

On February 11, 2023, BCI was notified of an Officer-Involved Critical Incident (OICI) which occurred in the parking lot of Home Depot located at 1680 Stringtown Road in Grove City, OH. It was learned Columbus Division of Police (CPD) SWAT Officers were executing an arrest warrant for subject Bret J. Andrews (Andrews). During the encounter, multiple CPD SWAT officers discharged their duty weapons. Andrews was transported to Grant Medical Center with alleged gunshot wounds, where he was pronounced deceased. A firearm was located during the incident which reportedly did not belong to any law enforcement officers on scene, and was collected by the BCI Crime Scene Unit (CSU).

The aforementioned firearm was submitted to the lab. Forensic Scientist Phillip Irion identified the firearm with serial #454–58298, Ruger EC9s, 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, registered to Dawn Kathleen Gregory of Columbus, OH. DNA samples were taken from the firearm but were not forwarded for analysis.

While processing the scene, CSU also recovered cartridge cases and fired projectiles in the vicinity of the OICI. Additional fired projectiles were collected from the autopsy of Andrews. A total of eleven (11) cartridge cases and twelve (12) fired projectiles were submitted to the lab for analysis.

Forensic Scientist Kelsey Cramer (FS Cramer) identified two of the 9mm Luger cartridge cases (Items 7–8) and two fired projectiles (Item 15–16) as being source identified to the Glock model 17 Gen5, 9mm Luger semiautomatic pistol, serial **# 100000000** (frame and barrel) / **# 10000000** (slide), assigned to CPD Officer Matthew Liford (Officer Liford).

FS Cramer identified three of the 9mm Luger cartridge cases (Items 1-3) and two fired projectiles (Items 26, 29) as being source identified to the Glock model 17 Gen5, 9mm Luger

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law – a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.

semiautomatic pistol, serial **# 1999 (frame and barrel**) / **# 1999 (slide)**, assigned to CPD Officer James Ashenhurst (Officer Ashenhurst).

FS Cramer identified six of the 9mm Luger cartridge cases (Items 4–6, 9–11) and eight fired projectiles (Items 14, 21–25, 27–28) as being source identified to the Glock model 17 Gen5, 9mm Luger semiautomatic pistol, serial **# Constant** assigned to CPD Officer Robert Cutshall (Officer Cutshall).

One fired cartridge case (Item 13) was source excluded from all firearms collected at the scene.

Attachments:

Attachment # 01: BCI Firearms Lab RPT-23-11636 00924462 Attachment # 02: BCI Firearms Lab RPT-23-11636 00924463

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law – a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.





Bureau of Criminal Investigation

Laboratory Report Firearms

To:	BCI / Madison Kyle Douglass	BCI Laboratory Number:	23-11636
	1560 S.R. 56 SW	Analysis Date:	Issue Date:
	London, OH 43140	February 27, 2023	March 08, 2023
		Agency Case Number: BCI Agent:	2023-0408 Sarah Taylor
Offense:	Shooting Involving an Officer	-	-
Subject(s):	N/A		
Victim(s):	N/A		

Submitted on February 14, 2023 by S/A Sarah Taylor:

1.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 1, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
2.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 2, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
3.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 3, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
4.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 4, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
5.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 5, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
6.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 6, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
7.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 7, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
8.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 8, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
9.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 9, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
10.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 11, scene #1)
10.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 11, scene #1)

- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case

Please address inquiries to the office indicated, using the BCI case number.

[] BCI -Bowling Green Office 750 North College Drive Bowling Green, OH 43402 Phone:(419)353-5603 [X] BCI -London Office
 1560 St Rt 56 SW P.O. Box 365
 London, OH 43140
 Phone:(740)845-2000

[] BCI -Richfield Office 4055 Highlander Pkwy. Suite A Richfield, OH 44286 Phone:(330)659-4600

Page 1 of 5

11.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 12, scene #1) - One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
12.	White box containing firearm (Serial # 454-58298) with magazine, and cartridges (BCI#13, scent #1)
	- One (1) Ruger model EC9s, 9mm Luger, semi-automatic pistol, serial number:
	454-58298, with one (1) magazine and seven (7) 9mm Luger cartridges
13.	One manila envelope containing fired cartridge case (BCI# 14, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case
14.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI# 16, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired bullet
15.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI# 19, scene #1)
	- One (1) fired bullet
16.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI# 21, scene #1) - One (1) fired bullet
17.	White box containing firearm (Serial# with magazine, and cartridges (BCI# 1, scene 2)
	- One (1) Glock model 17 Gen5, semi-automatic pistol, serial number:
	(frame and barrel) / (slide), with one (1) magazine and fifteen (15) 9mm
	Luger cartridges
18.	White box containing firearm (Serial# with magazine and cartridges (BCI# 2,
	scene 2)
	- One (1) Glock model 17 Gen5, semi-automatic pistol, serial number:
	(frame and barrel) / (slide), with one (1) magazine and sixteen (16) 9mm Luger cartridges
19.	White box containing firearm (Serial# General with magazines and cartridges (BCI#
17.	3, scene 2)
	- One (1) Glock model 17 Gen5, semi-automatic pistol, serial number:
	with one (1) magazine and ten (10) 9mm Luger cartridges
21.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#4, scene#4)
	- One (1) fired bullet
22.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#5, scene#4)
	- One (1) fired bullet
23.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#6, scene#4)
	- One (1) fired bullet
24.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#7, scene#4)
25	- One (1) fired bullet
25.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#8, scene#4)
26	- One (1) fired bullet
26.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#9, scene#4) - One (1) fired bullet
27.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#10, scene#4)
21.	- One (1) fired bullet
28.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#11, scene#4)
<i>_</i> 0.	- One (1) fired bullet
29.	One manila envelope containing fired projectile (BCI#12, scene#4)
	- One (1) fired bullet

Findings

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
	N/A	Operable
#17 : Glock pistol	#7 and #8 : two (2) fired cartridge cases	Source Identification
	#15 and #16 : two (2) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
	N/A	Operable
#18: Glock pistol	#1 , #2 , and #3 : three (3) fired cartridge cases	Source Identification
	#26 and #29 : two (2) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#19: Glock pistol	N/A	Operable
	#4, #5, #6, #9, #10, and #11: six (6) fired cartridge cases	Source Identification
	#14, #21, #22, #23, #24, #25, #27, and #28: eight (8) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
#12: Ruger pistol 454-58298	N/A	Operable

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
	#17 : Glock pistol	
#13 : one (1) fired cartridge case	#18: Glock pistol	
	#19 : Glock pistol	Source Exclusion
	#12: Ruger pistol 454-58298	

<u>Remarks</u>

Four (4) of the fifteen (15) submitted cartridges from item #17 were used for test firing. Four (4) of the sixteen (16) submitted cartridges from item #18 were used for test firing. Four (4) of the ten (10) submitted cartridges from item #19 were used for test firing. The remaining submitted items from items #12, #17, #18, and #19 were not examined at this time. No fired cartridge cases were entered into the NIBIN database. All evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Analytical Detail

Analytical findings offered above were determined using visual and microscopic examinations / comparisons.

Jelsey Cram

Kelsey Cramer Forensic Scientist (740) 845-2627 Kelsey.Cramer@OhioAGO.gov **%''\$''!.''*%#%)%ff%ff'')ff!*)#%''%\$\$%''f'')')!1**

Based on scientific analyses performed, this report contains opinions and interpretations by the analyst whose signature appears above. Examination documentation and any demonstrative data supporting laboratory conclusions are maintained by BCI and will be made available for review upon request.

Your feedback is important to us! Please complete our Laboratory Satisfaction Survey at: https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Q7V2N6H

23-11636

Lab Case:

Agency Case:

Lab Case: 23-11636 Agency Case: 2023-0408

Comparison Conclusion Scale

The following lists the conclusions a Forensic Scientist may reach when performing comparisons. In reaching a conclusion, a Forensic Scientist considers the similarities and dissimilarities and assesses the relative support of the observations under the following two propositions: the evidence originated from the same source or from a different source.

A Forensic Scientist may utilize their knowledge, training, and experience to evaluate how much support the observed similarities or dissimilarities provide for one conclusion over another. A conclusion shall not be communicated with absolute certainty. It is an interpretation of observations made by the Forensic Scientists and shall be expressed as an expert opinion.

1	Source Identification	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from a different source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility.
2	Support for Same Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source rather than different sources; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Identification. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
3	Inconclusive	The observations do not provide a sufficient degree of support for one proposition over the other. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
4	Support for Different Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from different sources rather than the same source; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Exclusion. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
5	Source Exclusion	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from a different source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from the same source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility; or the evidence exhibits fundamentally different characteristics

We invite you to direct your questions to:

Abby Schwaderer, Quality Assurance Manager (740) 845-2517

abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov



Bureau of Criminal Investigation

Laboratory Report DNA

To:BCI / Madison
Kyle Douglass
1560 S.R. 56 SW
London, OH 43140BCI Laboratory Number:23-11636Analysis Date:
February 21, 2023Issue Date:
February 22, 2023Agency Case Number:
BCI Agent:2023-0408
Sarah Taylor

Offense: Shooting Involving an Officer

Submitted on February 14, 2023 by S/A Sarah Taylor:

- 12. White box containing firearm (Serial # 454-58298) with magazine, and cartridges (BCI#13, scent #1)
- 20. One manila envelope containing FTA card from Bret Andrews (BCI# 1, scene #4)

Item	Conclusions	
12 Firearm		
12.1 Swabbing – trigger/trigger guard		
12.2 Swabbing - grip		
12.3 Swabbing – back of slide		
12.4 Swabbing - buttons	Samples collected for DNA analysis	
12.5 Swabbing – front sight		
12.6 Swabbing – magazine base		
12.7 Swabbing – magazine body		
12.8 Swabbing – live rounds		
20 FTA card	Not examined	

Remarks

Samples are not being forwarded for DNA analysis at this time. All evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Hille R. Irion

Phillip Irion Forensic Scientist 740-845-2450 Phillip.Irion@OhioAGO.gov

Based on visual examination and scientific analyses performed, this report contains opinions and interpretations by the analyst whose signature appears above. Examination documentation and any demonstrative data supporting laboratory conclusions are maintained by BCI and will be made available for review upon request.

Your feedback is important to us! Please complete our Laboratory Satisfaction Survey at: https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Q7V2N6H

Please address inquiries to the office indicated, using the BCI case number.

[] BCI -Bowling Green Office 750 North College Drive Bowling Green, OH 43402 Phone:(419)353-5603 [X] BCI -London Office
 1560 St Rt 56 SW P.O. Box 365
 London, OH 43140
 Phone:(740)845-2000

[] BCI -Richfield Office 4055 Highlander Pkwy. Suite A Richfield, OH 44286 Phone:(330)659-4600