



**Ohio Attorney General's Office
Bureau of Criminal Investigation
Investigative Report**



2024-1780

Officer Involved Critical Incident - [REDACTED]
Youngstown, Ohio

Investigative Activity: BCI Firearms laboratory report
Involves: [REDACTED], Mathue O'Malley (S)
Activity Date: 07/08/2024
Activity Location: BCI Richfield
Authoring Agent: SA Jon Lieber #50

Narrative:

On Monday, July 08, 2024, Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI) Special Agent (SA) Jon Lieber (Lieber) received Ohio BCI Laboratory report(s) for items of evidence submitted on June 13, 2024 for scientific analysis (laboratory case number 24-34397). The report originated from the Firearms section of the laboratory and was authored by Forensic Scientist Monica Coblentz. The items relevant to this report which had previously been submitted were as follows:

1. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#1)
2. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#2)
3. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#3)
4. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#4)
5. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#5)
6. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#6)
7. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#7)
8. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#8)
9. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#9)
10. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#10)
11. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#11)
12. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#12)
13. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#13)
14. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#14)
15. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#15)
16. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#16)
17. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#17)
18. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#18)
19. One manila envelope containing fired 9mm cartridge case (CS#19)
20. One manila envelope containing projectile - fired bullet (CS#21)
21. One manila envelope containing projectile - fired bullet (CS#22)

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law - a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.



**Ohio Attorney General's Office
Bureau of Criminal Investigation
Investigative Report**



2024-1780
Officer Involved Critical Incident - [REDACTED]
Youngstown, Ohio

- 22. One manila envelope containing projectile – fired bullet (CS#23)
- 23. One manila envelope containing projectile – fired bullet (CS#26)
- 24. One manila envelope containing projectile – fired bullet (CS#27)
- 25. One manila envelope containing projectile – fired bullet (CS#28)
- 26. One manila envelope containing fired bullet jacket fragment (CS#29)
- 27. One box containing [REDACTED] firearm, Sig Sauer, model P320, serial [REDACTED]; one magazine and six cartridges
- 28. One box containing Mathue O'Malley's firearm, Taurus, model G3, serial #ADC134241; one magazine and four cartridges

SA Lieber reviewed the laboratory report and noted the following:

Findings

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item #27: Sig Sauer Pistol	N/A	Operable
	Items #1-11: Eleven (11) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	Items #20, 21, 23, 25 & 26: Four (4) fired bullets and one (1) fired bullet jacket fragment	Inconclusive*
	Items #22 & 24: Two (2) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item #28: Taurus Pistol	N/A	Operable
	Items #12-19: Eight (8) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	Items #20, 21, 23, 25 & 26: Four (4) fired bullets and one (1) fired bullet jacket fragment	Inconclusive*

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Items #20, 21, 23, 25 & 26: Four (4) fired bullets and one (1) fired bullet jacket fragment	Intercompared	Inconclusive*

*Similar class characteristics but insufficient corresponding individual characteristics to identify or exclude.

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law - a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.



**Ohio Attorney General's Office
Bureau of Criminal Investigation
Investigative Report**



2024-1780

Officer Involved Critical Incident - [REDACTED]
Youngstown, Ohio

A copy of the Ohio BCI Laboratory report is attached to this investigative report. Please refer to the attachment for further details.

References:

None

Attachments:

1. 2024-07-08 BCI Firearms laboratory report

This document is the property of the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation and is confidential in nature. Neither the document nor its contents are to be disseminated outside your agency except as provided by law - a statute, an administrative rule, or any rule of procedure.



DAVE YOST

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Bureau of Criminal Investigation

**Laboratory Report
Firearms**

To: Ohio Attorney General's Office BCI Laboratory Number: 24-34397
 S/A Jon Lieber
 30 E. Broad Street Analysis Date: Issue Date:
 Columbus, OH 43215 June 25, 2024 July 02, 2024

Agency Case Number: 2024-1780
 BCI Agent: Jon Lieber

Offense: Shooting Involving an Officer
 Subject(s):
 Victim(s):

Submitted on 06/13/2024 by Betsy Farris

1. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 1)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
2. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 2)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
3. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 3)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
4. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 4)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
5. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 5)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
6. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 6)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
7. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 7)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
8. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 8)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
9. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 9)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
10. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 10)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*

Please address inquiries to the office indicated, using the BCI case number.

BCI -Bowling Green Office
 750 North College Drive
 Bowling Green, OH 43402
 Phone:(419)353-5603

BCI -London Office
 1560 St Rt 56 SW P.O. Box 365
 London, OH 43140
 Phone:(740)845-2000

BCI -Richfield Office
 4055 Highlander Pkwy. Suite A
 Richfield, OH 44286
 Phone:(330)659-4600

MG

11. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 11)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
12. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 12)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
13. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 13)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
14. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 14)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
15. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 15)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
16. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 16)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
17. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 17)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
18. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 18)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
19. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 19)
 - *One (1) fired 9mm Luger cartridge case.*
20. One manila envelope containing projectile (Crime Scene Item 21)
 - *One (1) fired bullet.*
21. One manila envelope containing projectile (Crime Scene Item 22)
 - *One (1) fired bullet.*
22. One manila envelope containing projectile (Crime Scene Item 23)
 - *One (1) fired bullet.*
23. One manila envelope containing projectile (Crime Scene Item 26)
 - *One (1) fired bullet.*
24. One manila envelope containing projectile (Crime Scene Item 27)
 - *One (1) fired bullet.*
25. One manila envelope containing cartridge case (Crime Scene Item 28)
 - *One (1) fired bullet.*
26. One manila envelope containing projectile (Crime Scene Item 29)
 - *One (1) fired bullet jacket fragment.*
27. One box containing firearm [REDACTED] and magazine with cartridges
 - *One (1) Sig Sauer 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, model P320, serial number [REDACTED]; one (1) magazine and six (6) cartridges.*
28. One box containing firearm (subject's) serial #ADC134241 with magazine and cartridges
 - *One (1) Taurus 9mm Luger semi-automatic pistol, model G3, serial number ADC134241; one (1) magazine, four (4) cartridges, and one (1) manila envelope containing previously generated BCI test fires.*

Findings

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item #27: Sig Sauer Pistol	N/A	Operable
	Items #1-11: Eleven (11) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	Items #20, 21, 23, 25 & 26: Four (4) fired bullets and one (1) fired bullet jacket fragment	Inconclusive*
	Items #22 & 24: Two (2) fired bullets	Source Identification

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item #28: Taurus Pistol	N/A	Operable
	Items #12-19: Eight (8) fired 9mm Luger cartridge cases	Source Identification
	Items #20, 21, 23, 25 & 26: Four (4) fired bullets and one (1) fired bullet jacket fragment	Inconclusive*

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Items #20, 21, 23, 25 & 26: Four (4) fired bullets and one (1) fired bullet jacket fragment	Intercompared	Inconclusive*

*Similar class characteristics but insufficient corresponding individual characteristics to identify or exclude.

Remarks

Two (2) BCI-supplied and two (2) submitted cartridges were used for testing Item #27.

Two (2) BCI-supplied and two (2) submitted cartridges were used for testing Item #28.

The previously generated BCI test fires contained with Item #28 were not opened or examined.

All evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Analytical Detail

Analytical findings offered above were determined using visual, physical, and microscopic examinations / comparisons.

Monica Coblentz

Monica Coblentz
Forensic Scientist
(234) 400-3715
Monica.Coblentz@OhioAGO.gov



Based on scientific analyses performed, this report contains opinions and interpretations by the analyst whose signature appears above. Examination documentation and any demonstrative data supporting laboratory conclusions are maintained by BCI and will be made available for review upon request. Results relate only to the items tested.

Your feedback is important to us! Please complete our Laboratory Satisfaction Survey at: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Q9VQHL5>

Comparison Conclusion Scale

The following lists the conclusions a Forensic Scientist may reach when performing comparisons. In reaching a conclusion, a Forensic Scientist considers the similarities and dissimilarities and assesses the relative support of the observations under the following two propositions: the evidence originated from the same source or from a different source.

A Forensic Scientist may utilize their knowledge, training, and experience to evaluate how much support the observed similarities or dissimilarities provide for one conclusion over another. A conclusion shall not be communicated with absolute certainty. It is an interpretation of observations made by the Forensic Scientists and shall be expressed as an expert opinion.

1	Source Identification	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from a different source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility.
2	Support for Same Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source rather than different sources; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Identification. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
3	Inconclusive	The observations do not provide a sufficient degree of support for one proposition over the other. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
4	Support for Different Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from different sources rather than the same source; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Exclusion. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
5	Source Exclusion	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from a different source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from the same source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility; or the evidence exhibits fundamentally different characteristics

We invite you to direct your questions to:
Abby Schwaderer, Quality Assurance Manager
(740) 845-2517
abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Monica Coblentz
Statement of Qualifications
Monica.Coblentz@OhioAGO.gov

Education

- Bachelor's Degree in Forensic Biology with minors in Chemistry and Criminal Justice. December 2015. Ashland University. Ashland, Ohio.

Professional Experience-

- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Forensic Scientist. June 2022- Current.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Laboratory Technician II (NIBIN). October 2021- June 2022.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Laboratory Technician I. March 2021- October 2021.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Evidence Intake Technician. February 2020- March 2021.

Required Technical Training-

- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Firearms Training. 2022-2023.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Laboratory Technician II Training. 2021-2022.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Laboratory Technician I Training. 2021.
- Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. Evidence Intake Technician Training. 2020.

A complete CV can be made available upon request

Updated 03/27/2024