

Protecting Ohio's Families



Ohio Attorney General's Office
Human Trafficking



2013
Annual Report



MIKE DEWINE
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

OHIO HUMAN TRAFFICKING
COMMISSION



MIKE DEWINE

★ OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL ★

January 9, 2014

Dear Fellow Ohioans:

Over the past year, Ohio has continued its fight against the horrors of human trafficking. Since re-convening the Human Trafficking Commission in 2011, my office has become increasingly invested in the issue by devoting resources to start a task force to investigate these crimes in the Central Ohio area; funding programs that work with human trafficking victims; and providing human trafficking training to law enforcement.

My office's Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force has worked to investigate traffickers and assist in rescuing human trafficking victims. The task force referred 57 victims to social services and offered assistance to 100 additional potential victims in the last year. My office also issued the first report containing local law enforcement human trafficking data, with updated statistics contained in this report. I am proud of the efforts that law enforcement continues to make to combat this crime.

The Human Trafficking Commission spent a great deal of time this year on new legislation designed to curb the demand for commercial sex that provides the market for human trafficking victims. This law, if passed, will make it easier to convict traffickers who manipulate teens into the dark underworld of human trafficking. This legislation will provide law enforcement and prosecutors with additional tools to fight trafficking in Ohio.

I would like to thank the Human Trafficking Commission, and all of those who have spent the past year working with victims to help them heal. I would also like to thank those who investigate traffickers to prevent more harm to victims, and those who educate the public to strengthen our communities against this crime.

As we observe Ohio's 5th annual Human Trafficking Awareness Day, we can be proud of the life-saving work done to combat human trafficking in our state. However, we know that we still have more to do because nothing is more important than protecting Ohio's children and families from those who would harm them. I look forward to working with each of you in the coming year to continue our efforts to end the abuse of human trafficking.

Very respectfully yours,

Mike DeWine
Ohio Attorney General

Human Trafficking Commission Activities

The Attorney General's Human Trafficking Commission continues to work on a broad range of projects dealing with all facets of the human trafficking issue. Through its six subcommittees, the Commission has dedicated the past year to creating a better framework for human trafficking victims so that they can heal from their victimization and become survivors.

Law Enforcement Subcommittee

The Law Enforcement Subcommittee is comprised of federal, state, city and county law enforcement officers. The subcommittee continues to monitor the training of all law enforcement officers in the state on human trafficking, and encourages all law enforcement agencies to report statistics on human trafficking complaints and investigations to the Attorney General's Office as required by the Safe Harbor Law. Members of the subcommittee continue to educate the public and other law enforcement officers on the needs of human trafficking victims.

In addition, the subcommittee has facilitated law enforcement's sharing of information related to human trafficking investigations by maintaining and distributing a contact list of human trafficking investigators across the state. Human trafficking often involves the movement of victims across the state (and even the country) to follow the demand for sex. The multi-jurisdictional aspect of these investigations makes sharing information across law enforcement jurisdictions crucial. The Law Enforcement subcommittee will continue to facilitate interagency sharing and make contacts among those law enforcement officers investigating human trafficking in Ohio.

Legal & Legislative Subcommittee

The Legal and Legislative Subcommittee has focused on drafting and refining House Bill 130, the new human trafficking bill, also called The End Demand Act. This legislation is a follow up to House Bill 262, which was introduced by subcommittee chair State Representative Teresa Fedor (D-Toledo) and passed in the summer of 2012. HB 130 was introduced on April 16, 2013 and passed out of the House on June 26, 2013. The bill is currently awaiting hearings in the Criminal Justice committee of the Ohio Senate.

The most crucial provisions of this legislation target those who sell and purchase sex with minors. The legislation removes the need to prove that a minor or someone with a developmental disability was compelled to engage in sex for hire under Ohio Revised Code section 2905.32. Under HB 130, a person can be convicted as a trafficker if he or she knowingly recruits, lures, entices, isolates, harbors, transports, provides, obtains, or maintains (or attempts to do any of these things to) a minor or person with a developmental disability knowing that the person will be subjected to involuntary servitude or any one of three types of commercial sexual activity. This acknowledges that minors and those with developmental disabilities are more vulnerable to manipulation by traffickers. This also brings Ohio's trafficking in persons law in line with federal law, which does not require any compulsion element be proven for minor sex trafficking victims.

Next, the legislation increases the penalty for those who solicit sex with minors from a third degree misdemeanor to a third degree felony. This intends to stop the demand for sex with minors by targeting the johns who purchase them.

The legislation also removes the "mistake of age" defense in Ohio's importuning statute. Currently, the portion of H.B. 262 that became of the Ohio Revised Code states that if the victim is 16 or 17, in order to be guilty of importuning, the john has to "know or have reckless disregard" of the age of the victim. This allows the john, the purchaser of sex, a defense of mistake of age. Under House Bill 130, this would be amended so that all importuners of minors will be treated the same, regardless of whether the minor is 17 or 14.

Further, the legislation creates the new crime of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of a Minor to keep traffickers from advertising minors. This provision prohibits advertising sexual activity for hire that includes the depiction of a minor and makes such advertising a third degree felony. The provision was created to target those traffickers who advertise minors for sex on online escort forums.

Finally, the statute restricts advertising massage services to those who are licensed to practice massage. A violation of the statute will constitute the unlawful advertising of massage, a fifth degree felony. This provision was created to target massage parlors that are a mere front for commercial sexual activity which provide a market for human trafficking.

Attorney General DeWine has also focused on training the legal community about current Ohio laws against human trafficking. Attorney General staff partnered with the Ohio State Bar Association to provide legal training to attorneys statewide, and the Columbus Bar Association to provide training to other legal professionals. In December 2013, the Attorney General's Office, along with the Wood County Prosecutor's Office, presented a human trafficking workshop at the Ohio Prosecuting Attorneys Association to educate those in

attendance on the state trafficking in persons law. The Attorney General's Office also published an article on human trafficking in the Ohio Lawyer Magazine, a publication of the Ohio State Bar Association, to educate all attorneys on the basics of human trafficking in Ohio. Greater awareness of trafficking in the legal community is critical to ensuring that victims are properly identified and well represented in the justice system and that traffickers are held accountable for their crimes.

The Legal and Legislative subcommittee will continue to monitor Ohio law to ensure that victims are rescued and human traffickers are brought to justice. In addition, the Ohio Attorney General's Office remains committed to training the legal and criminal justice communities to ensure their knowledge of all Ohio human trafficking laws is current.

Prevention, Education & Awareness Subcommittee

The Prevention, Education & Awareness Subcommittee focuses on "supply-side" prevention, which seeks to reduce the number and vulnerabilities of potential victims through awareness-raising, education, and outreach. Subcommittee members are currently in the process of reviewing anti-human trafficking curricula and outreach programs for high schools and middle schools from across the country and the state. These programs are being evaluated and used to develop a set of presentation and content standards. The purpose is not to set up a single approved curriculum or program, but to develop standards and tools to expand and improve the variety of efforts already on-going across the state.

Next, the subcommittee is developing tools and content and delivery standards for Human Trafficking "Speakers' Bureaus" around the state. Speakers Bureaus are comprised of volunteer community members who have been trained and equipped to give Human Trafficking 101 presentations to the public. These tools and standards will assist already existing Speakers' Bureaus and aid in the expansion and development of new ones.

Further, the Commission, coalitions, and anti-trafficking networks across the state will be used to identify passionate, influential leaders in key fields and professions, such as Law Enforcement, Legal, Education, Health Care, Business, Youth, Faith, and others. These leaders, or "Champions," will be offered materials, training, and support to develop their anti-trafficking knowledge and presentation skills. Incentives, likely in the form of free or reduced-cost professional development/continuing education credits, will be offered to persuade "Champions" to give presentations, training, and support to others in their fields. "Champions" will speak the same language as their colleagues in their fields and will have more credibility than outsiders. This effort will ensure that key professions have leaders who

have advanced human trafficking knowledge and can serve as a resource for others in their field.

Finally, the Prevention, Education & Awareness subcommittee plans to coordinate, review, and post online anti-trafficking materials. The long term goal is to develop a “one stop shop” for resources for those interested in human trafficking in Ohio. The subcommittee will continue its efforts to reduce the supply of victims by building awareness of human trafficking over the coming year.

Research & Analysis Subcommittee

The Research and Analysis Subcommittee has focused on follow up to the 2012 Domestic Sex Trafficking Report. In this study, the Research & Analysis Subcommittee completed a five-city research project to identify the high risk factors for youth who become victims of domestic minor sex trafficking. An immediate assessment for first responders and front line workers was developed and is named RESCUE CHILD. Each letter in RESCUE CHILD stands for a risk factor:

- R Runaway
- E Education
- S Sexual Assault
- C Court Appearances
- U Using Drugs/Alcohol
- E Emotional Abuse

- C Child Abuse/Neglect
- H Homelessness
- I Influential Others
- L Loving someone much older
- D Difficulty making friends

Throughout 2013, the subcommittee has focused on writing supplemental reports specific to each of the five cities involved in the original study. These cities include Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, Dayton, and Toledo. The purpose of these supplemental reports is to provide community-level anti-human trafficking organizations – such as regional coalitions – with city-specific assessments and recommendations to respond strategically to domestic sex trafficking of minors. Specifically, the subcommittee assessed each statistically significant risk factor listed above to determine the number and type of services being offered in each city. The purpose is to assist coalitions in understanding how their city currently responds to each risk factor and to identify the gaps between the type of risk to youth in a particular city and the current number of services offered to reduce or respond to

the risk. Finally, the subcommittee will make recommendations on how each coalition can assist its community in adequately responding to each risk factor.

In the coming year, the subcommittee will focus on revising these supplemental regional reports and getting them out to the public. Most data for the supplemental reports has been collected. In April, the committee will release the drafts to the chairs of each coalition in the five cities to elicit feedback. The subcommittee anticipates that the reports will be released to the full commission and the general public this summer.

Victim Services & Safe Locations Subcommittee

Over the past year, the Victim Services & Safe Locations Subcommittee has worked with anti-trafficking advocates and coalitions throughout Ohio to strengthen our state's human trafficking response network. The subcommittee launched a voluntary Peer Review process for organizations serving trafficking survivors. The Peer Review process is conducted by trained anti-trafficking advocates and involves a review of each organization's service standards to ensure that human trafficking survivors are receiving the highest quality of care.

The subcommittee has also worked to promote a successful partnership between Ohio's anti-trafficking coalitions and Child Advocacy Centers. In August 2013, the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services announced that it would contract with Ohio's 26 children's advocacy centers to provide services to minor human trafficking victims. The Victim Services & Safe Locations Subcommittee worked collaboratively with the Ohio Network of Child Advocacy Centers, the Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force, the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services, and the Department of Public Safety to help forge close working relationships between the children's advocacy centers and the human trafficking responders in the communities.

Finally, the subcommittee developed a response protocol for child victims of human trafficking. This collaborative process brought together advocates from around Ohio to update and clarify procedures for assisting child victims and to integrate the children's advocacy centers into response protocols.

In the coming year, the subcommittee will focus on building capacity for medically-supervised detox services for human trafficking victims, creating short-term safe housing for trafficking victims, and increasing trauma- and trafficking-specific treatment options for survivors.

Demand Reduction Subcommittee

The Demand Reduction subcommittee is working toward reducing demand for forced labor and compelled commercial sexual activity in Ohio, with a focus on both potential consumers and the traffickers.

In February, the Demand Reduction subcommittee issued a report on “john schools” in Ohio. Subcommittee member Maggie Billings collected information from john school diversion programs in Cincinnati, Columbus, Dayton and Toledo. Although often modeled after the First Offender Prostitution Program in San Francisco, each john school in Ohio is structured differently and operates independently. The goals of the report are to better understand what is going on with existing programs, be a central source for information on these programs, share information between existing programs, and assist other cities interested in instituting a program. An increased law enforcement focus on reverse sting operations to arrest johns (the buyers of sex) is needed to ensure referrals to the john schools.

Subcommittee members identified a need for continuous study on prevention and demand reduction as this is still a relatively new area of work within human trafficking. A survey of human trafficking education programs for youth was completed and distributed, including prevention and demand reduction strategies content. Work is in progress to identify areas for future research, and to create linkages with institutions to conduct this research.

The Demand Reduction subcommittee is currently creating a series of educational handouts to create better public awareness around the definition of prevention, primary prevention, and the relationship of fair trade to prevention work. Future work will include partnering with the Prevention, Education and Awareness committee to incorporate demand reduction strategies into the broader education and awareness efforts; this will be a multi-step process which will include identifying effective strategies and partnering to promote their use. Reducing demand is important to eradicating the market for human trafficking.

Law Enforcement Updates

Law enforcement has made great strides in its awareness of and response to human trafficking activity across the state. 2013 marked the first conviction under the trafficking in persons statute. The Attorney General's Office provides law enforcement training through the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy, investigative resources through the Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force, and collects local law enforcement human trafficking data to help the public understand the human trafficking problem in Ohio. Attorney General DeWine continues to dedicate resources to ensure that law enforcement have the tools necessary to investigate human trafficking cases.

Local Law Enforcement Human Trafficking Statistics

House Bill 262, which was passed in 2012, requires local law enforcement to collect information on human trafficking investigations and forward this data to the Bureau of Criminal Investigations (BCI). In 2013, law enforcement reported 30 human trafficking investigations leading to 16 arrests and 9 prosecutions. Seven prosecutions resulted in successful convictions against traffickers.

Law enforcement agencies further reported the numbers of victims, traffickers, and buyers/johns they identified over the past year. The human trafficking victims who most often came to the attention of law enforcement over the past year were largely young white adults who were victims of sex trafficking. Twenty-three sex trafficking victims were identified, with 22 being female and one being male. Of the female victims, most were young adults aged 21-29 (13), seven were aged 18-20, and 3 victims were identified as being aged 16-17. Only one male victim was identified. Seventeen victims were identified as white, five victims were identified as black, and there were no victims identified as Asian/Pacific Islander or American Indian/Native Alaskan.

Though the majority of the cases included in the law enforcement data were sex trafficking, law enforcement did identify one labor trafficking victim. This victim was 16-17 years old.

Over the past year, law enforcement identified 21 total traffickers, including 19 sex traffickers and 2 labor traffickers. These traffickers were split evenly in terms of race: 11 traffickers were identified as black and 10 traffickers were identified as white. Demographic information was not provided for all of the traffickers. However, for those traffickers whose information was provided, fifteen were male and two were female. On the whole, the traffickers identified by law enforcement were older than their victims. Seven traffickers

were in the 21-29 year old age group, five of the traffickers were 30-40, and 4 were age 41-59.

The number of buyers/johns identified by law enforcement increased from the last report published in June of 2013. From June 2012 through June 2013, only 30 johns were identified. For the second half of 2013, 40 additional johns were identified, bringing the total number to 70 johns identified in 2013. 40 johns were identified as white, and 30 were recorded as of “unknown” race. All of the johns identified were male. Johns, like traffickers, tended to be older than the female victims. Of the johns whose age was identified, 32 were aged 30-40, and eight were aged 41-59.

Trafficking can involve movement of victims across cities, states, or even the country. Law enforcement identified a motor vehicle as the method of transportation in 18 cases, and an airplane in only one case. In four cases, law enforcement stated that the method of transportation was “non-applicable,” which likely means that the case did not involve transportation.

Finally, law enforcement agencies were asked to categorize the social and/or economic factors leading to trafficking. The underlying risk factor in ten cases was “oppressed, marginalized, and/or impoverished,” and in seven cases the risk factor selected was “drug/alcohol/other dependency.” However, it is unclear whether the drug or alcohol dependency came before the victimization, or during the victimization to ensure victim compliance or as a coping mechanism.

Though law enforcement only reported 30 human trafficking investigations, there was an increase in arrests under other statutes that likely involved human trafficking. In 2013, law enforcement made 52 arrests for compelling prostitution and 105 for promoting prostitution. This is an increase from the number of promoting and compelling prostitution arrests from June 2012-June 2013, when data revealed 92 arrests for promoting prostitution and 33 arrests for compelling prostitution. There is a clear increase in the number of human trafficking arrests, but law enforcement are still charging under old statutes rather than the trafficking in persons statute that became effective in 2011.

This data is helpful because it shows the trends of what law enforcement is identifying as human trafficking in Ohio. In 2013, cases that came to the attention of law enforcement involved many young girls as victims and older men as both the traffickers and johns. Notably, law enforcement identified a male victim, and labor trafficking. Cases involving male victims and labor trafficking cases have historically been identified less frequently by law enforcement. The fact that law enforcement has started to identify these more difficult

cases is a positive direction for Ohio. Though human trafficking remains an underreported crime, the data reveals an increase in law enforcement activity in this area.

Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force

The Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force was created by the Ohio Organized Crime Investigations Commission as a law enforcement collaborative formed to investigate human trafficking cases in the Central Ohio area. The Task Force was announced in August 2012 and is primarily composed of officers from the Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI), the Columbus Police Department, the Powell Police Department, the U.S. Attorney's Office, the Delaware County Prosecutor's Office, U.S. Customs and Immigration Enforcement (ICE), the Salvation Army, the Ohio State Highway Patrol, and the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI).

The Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force continues to provide victim-centered law enforcement efforts throughout the central Ohio area to combat human trafficking. The Task Force has referred more than 57 victims to social services, offered assistance to 100 additional potential victims, and obtained convictions of seven sex traffickers in 2013. In 2014, Attorney General DeWine's Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force will continue efforts to fight human trafficking throughout the area.

Law Enforcement Training

Attorney General DeWine's Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy actively trains local law enforcement to identify and investigate cases of human trafficking in Ohio. The Safe Harbor Law passed in 2012 contained new mandatory training requirements for law enforcement, which the Ohio Peace Officer Training Commission has now woven into the basic training that all peace officers are required to complete in Ohio. This will ensure that all law enforcement officers are armed with awareness about human trafficking and tools on how to investigate these crimes.

In addition, the Attorney General's Office, through the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy, created a series of three online courses to educate local law enforcement officers, in addition to offering both basic and advanced in-person trainings. These online courses are designed for those officers who were commissioned as peace officers prior to human trafficking being incorporated into the basic training, or for newer law enforcement officers who would like additional training on human trafficking. In 2013, 104 officers attended OPOTA's in person human trafficking trainings, and 10,496 officers took the online trainings. The public can view these courses, along with other online human trafficking trainings, at www.OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov/HumanTrafficking under the "Online Human Trafficking

Training” tab. Due to the new human trafficking training that is included in the basic peace officer curriculum, aspiring law enforcement officers will be well-equipped to identify human trafficking victims across the state.

Conclusion

Over the past year, Ohio has made great progress in setting up a framework to better assist victims of human trafficking. Professionals on the front-lines working with potential victims and the public are becoming increasingly aware of the signs of human trafficking and the devastation this crime causes in the lives of its victims. Ohio must continue its work to identify and support victims, lock up traffickers, and target the demand for sex over the coming years.



Ohio Attorney General's Office
Human Trafficking

2013
Annual Report

For more information:

**Ohio Attorney General's Office
Programs and Development
30 E. Broad St., 17th floor
Columbus, OH 43215**

614-728-7275

www.OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov



MIKE DEWINE

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

www.OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov