

Protecting Ohio's Families



Ohio Attorney General's Office
Human Trafficking



2014

Annual Report



MIKE DEWINE
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

OHIO HUMAN TRAFFICKING
COMMISSION



MIKE DEWINE

★ OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL ★

January 26, 2015

Dear Fellow Ohioans,

In the past year, we have taken several actions in our continued fight against the horrendous crime of human trafficking. My office focused on strengthening protections for victims, creating stiffer penalties for traffickers, and continuing to educate Ohioans on what human trafficking is and what can be done to help end it.

The Ohio Attorney General's Human Trafficking Commission has worked tirelessly to assist victims of human trafficking to obtain services and begin to reclaim their lives. The Legal and Legislative Subcommittee, in collaboration with the Commission and the Ohio General Assembly, helped to successfully craft and pass legislation providing better protections to minor-age victims and stronger penalties for those who traffic children.

My office's Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force has continued to play a crucial role in investigating traffickers and assisting victims. Officers with the Task Force were able to identify 84 potential victims who were either rescued or referred to social services for assistance and successfully obtained seven criminal convictions. I am proud of the work of the Central Ohio Task Force, as well as the progress that local law enforcement agencies are making across the state.

As we begin a new year, I thank the members of our Human Trafficking Commission and all those across the state who have dedicated their time and efforts in the fight against this heinous crime. The criminals who enslave and abuse vulnerable Ohioans must be and will be held accountable.

Our work is not done, and nothing is more important than protecting Ohio's children and families from harm. I look forward to continuing our work in the coming year to help end human trafficking.

Very respectfully yours,

Mike DeWine
Ohio Attorney General

Human Trafficking Commission Activities

In 2014, the Attorney General's Human Trafficking Commission continued its work on a wide range of projects and initiatives aimed at helping to put an end to human trafficking in Ohio. The Commission is made up of the following six subcommittees focusing on individual as well as collaborative efforts to end the demand for trafficking in Ohio, and to provide improved services to the victims and survivors.

Law Enforcement Subcommittee

The Law Enforcement Subcommittee is comprised of federal, state, city and county law enforcement officers. The subcommittee monitors the training of all law enforcement officers in the state on human trafficking and encourages all law enforcement agencies to report statistics on human trafficking complaints and investigations to the Attorney General's Office as required by the Safe Harbor Law. Members of the subcommittee continue to educate the public and other law enforcement officers on the needs of human trafficking victims, as well as investigative methods to help ensure human trafficking offenders are brought to justice.

In addition, the subcommittee continues to facilitate law enforcement's sharing of information related to human trafficking investigations. The multi-jurisdictional aspect of these investigations makes sharing information across law enforcement jurisdictions crucial. The subcommittee will continue to facilitate interagency sharing and make contacts among those law enforcement officers investigating human trafficking in Ohio. Similarly, the subcommittee will also continue to explore other opportunities for collaborative efforts around the state in order to ensure that law enforcement efforts can be most effective.

Legal & Legislative Subcommittee

In 2014, the Legal and Legislative Subcommittee focused its attention on passing House Bill 130, the End Demand Act, which was introduced by subcommittee chair State Representative Teresa Fedor (D-Toledo). On June 20, 2014, Governor John Kasich signed Am. Sub. House Bill 130 into law, effective immediately.

The most crucial provisions of the End Demand Act focused on those who sell and purchase sex with minors. The goal of the new bill was to bring Ohio law in line with the federal Trafficking in Persons law. The law removed the need to prove that a minor or someone with a developmental disability was compelled to engage in sex for hire. This provision in the law acknowledges that minors and those with developmental disabilities are more vulnerable to manipulation by traffickers.

Next, the law increased the penalty for those who solicit sex from a minor less than 16 years of age or a developmentally disabled person from a misdemeanor to a felony offense and requires the offender to register as a tier two sex offender. It also increased the penalty for purchasing sex from a minor aged 16-17 to a felony of the fifth degree. The goal of this part of the law was to stop the demand for sex with minors by targeting the johns who purchase them.

Additionally, the law also increased protections for minors by prohibiting advertisement of sexual activity for hire if the materials depict a minor. This was done to target those traffickers who advertise minors for sex on online escort forums.

Furthermore, the law gave child welfare and court officials the authority to terminate parental rights of a parent convicted of trafficking his or her own child.

Finally, the law restricted the advertising of massage services to only those who are licensed to practice massage. Now, the advertisement of massage, relaxation massage, or any other massage technique or method with the suggestion or promise of sexual activity is prohibited. A violation of the statute will constitute the unlawful advertising of massage, a first degree misdemeanor.

The Legal and Legislative Subcommittee was pleased with the gains made in the state ratings on human trafficking laws, released by Shared Hope International, a leading organization in the fight against human trafficking and modern-day slavery. The State of Ohio received 78 out of 100 points – up 5 ½ points from its grade of 72.5 in 2013. With the recent passage of House Bill 130, End Demand Act, Ohio saw gains in the areas of, “Criminalization of Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking, Criminal Provisions for Traffickers and Protective Provisions for Child Victims.”

The Legal and Legislative Subcommittee will continue to carefully monitor the implementation of Ohio’s human trafficking laws, specifically House Bill 262 and House Bill 130 – and act responsively to any issues or concerns.

Prevention, Education, & Awareness (PEA) Subcommittee

2014 was a year of networking, resource-building, and deliberation for the Prevention, Education and Awareness Subcommittee. The subcommittee focused on developing tools and guidelines for educators and community members so they can engage youth on the issue of human trafficking.

The subcommittee chair was invited to join the advisory board for the National Educators to Stop Trafficking (NEST), which is undertaking work at the national level similar to that being done by subcommittee. The chair has been coordinating with NEST in the review of anti-human trafficking (AHT) curricula and programs, expanding a national network of AHT

educators, and developing tools for educators. In 2015, the subcommittee will be working with NEST on a set of evaluation criteria for AHT curricula and programs.

The subcommittee held a series of meetings to discuss the issue and develop guidelines for AHT education of school-aged children. A database of over 40 curricula and programs was created and initial evaluation of these programs has been completed.

Subcommittee members provided feedback which is being evaluated and incorporated into a detailed plan for grades 7-12 that will be released by the summer of 2015.

The subcommittee also is working on a two-pronged approach for youth education: 1) a lower intensity awareness-raising program for general student populations and 2) a higher intensity prevention program for at-risk student populations.

In 2015, in addition to developing guidelines for AHT Education for grades 7-12, the subcommittee and NEST will evaluate AHT programs for grades K-6. The group will also focus on promoting human trafficking awareness and education at the college and university level.

Research & Analysis Subcommittee

In 2012 the Research and Analysis Subcommittee conducted a study across five Ohio cities: Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, Dayton, and Toledo to produce the Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking in Ohio Report. This study identified key risk factors for trafficking that created the acronym “RESCUE CHILD”:

Runaway	Child abuse/neglect
Education	Homelessness
Sexual Assault	Influential Others
Court Appearances	Loving someone much older
Using Drugs/Alcohol	Difficulty making friends
Emotional Abuse	

In 2014, the Report and the identified risk factors were used to create individualized reports for each of the five cities included in the study. The report provided a problem assessment, response, and recommendation for each risk factor. The problem assessment described each risk factor and how prevalent it is to that particular city. The response is a description of the programs and services available in the specified city that respond to the problem/risk factor. Recommendations were then made to each city on ways to improve the response to the problem/risk factor beyond what was already being done in that particular city.

Each city report was shared with the local anti-human trafficking coalition in each city. The subcommittee is currently seeking feedback on how the reports will benefit each city, how the reports can be improved, as well as any errors or outdated information within the report. The subcommittee plans on meeting with each anti-human trafficking coalition to collect feedback in early 2015. After this additional data is collected, the subcommittee will revise the reports for release to the Commission and the community at large.

The goals of the subcommittee for 2015 include surveying key groups to understand the next critical research question that needs to be answered with respect to human trafficking in Ohio, pursuing a plan to accomplish the project, and securing funding that includes research across pertinent universities.

Demand Reduction Subcommittee

The Demand Reduction Subcommittee continues to work toward the reduction of demand for forced labor and compelled commercial sexual activity in Ohio, with a focus on both potential consumers and the traffickers.

The subcommittee completed a white paper overview on human trafficking demand reduction and a “getting started on prevention” conversation handout. The overview and the handout were submitted to the Human Trafficking Commission and the Attorney General’s Office for review. The subcommittee is working on revisions based on the feedback provided.

Currently, work is in progress on a variety of other training materials, including free trade and its relationship to demand-reduction work; an in-depth look at the primary prevention of human trafficking; a prevention handout for at-risk individuals; and training resources for a range of audiences including the general public, educators, and the abolition community.

Members of the subcommittee traveled to southwest and northwest Ohio to meet with, learn from, and share information with organizations and law enforcement working on anti-human trafficking efforts in those communities.

Subcommittee members will continue to partner with the Prevention, Education and Awareness subcommittee and other local and national human trafficking prevention providers to incorporate demand reduction strategies into broader education and awareness efforts.

Victim Services Subcommittee

In early 2014, the Victim Services Subcommittee embarked on a strategic planning process to identify goals and strategies for the next two years. At its initial meeting in February 2014, members identified a number of strengths in Ohio's human trafficking victim services systems. These strengths included strong leadership and vision within Ohio's public offices and legislature, fostered by Governor John Kasich's Human Trafficking Task Force, Attorney General Mike DeWine's leadership of the Ohio Human Trafficking Commission and Ohio Representative Teresa Fedor's work to strengthen Ohio's human trafficking laws.

The subcommittee noted that collaborative engagement of Ohio's public offices with law enforcement and Ohio's human trafficking coalitions has resulted in several key advancements in victim identification and victim services in recent years. A general increase in awareness about human trafficking has led to increased victim identification. Focused training of healthcare, child welfare, Child Advocacy Centers, juvenile justice and other professionals also has increased victim identification and improved treatment responses. Other identified strengths included a growing number of law enforcement human trafficking task forces in Ohio and the effective partnership between the Ohio Human Trafficking Commission, the State of Ohio's Anti-Human Trafficking Coordinator and Ohio's anti-trafficking coalitions.

Despite these advances, the subcommittee identified a number of remaining gaps in Ohio's human trafficking response system. While many counties have effective 24-hour response protocols, 24 Ohio counties have no formal human trafficking response protocols or training. Even in areas with formal response protocols, immediate access to drug and alcohol detox and treatment services for victims is extremely limited. Moreover, victim services advocates struggle to identify affordable trauma-informed therapy and treatment for survivors.

The subcommittee noted that Ohio has gained expertise in identifying female victims of sex trafficking. However, there is a lag in the identification of labor trafficking victims in general as well as foreign national, male and LGBTQ victims.

Based on this analysis, the subcommittee established several goals for 2014-2015. The first goal was to increase 24-hour emergency response coverage in Ohio. In order to meet this goal, the subcommittee worked to help establish two new coalitions in Delaware and Medina counties in 2014 and assisted the existing coalitions to extend emergency response coverage into four new counties. Second, the subcommittee developed a map of housing and detox resources for human trafficking victims in Ohio.

In 2015, the subcommittee will continue to focus on increasing Ohio's capacity to identify marginalized and under identified human trafficking victims.

Law Enforcement Updates

Law enforcement made great strides in 2014 in its awareness of and response to human trafficking across the state. The Attorney General's Office assists by providing law enforcement with training through the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy; by offering investigative resources through the Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force; and by collecting human trafficking data from local law enforcement to help the public understand the scope problem in Ohio. Attorney General Mike DeWine continues to dedicate resources to ensure that law enforcement has the necessary tools to investigate human trafficking cases.

Local Law Enforcement Human Trafficking Statistics

House Bill 262, passed in 2012, requires local law enforcement to collect data on human trafficking investigations and forward this information to the Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI). According to the data collected in 2014, law enforcement reported 85 human trafficking investigations leading to 98 arrests and 17 successful criminal convictions. Three of the 17 convictions were prosecuted under Ohio Revised Code 2905.32, the State of Ohio's Trafficking in Persons statute.

The first of these three convictions, under the state law, occurred in January 2014. The trafficker was arrested on December 2, 2012 after an extensive investigation by the Garfield Heights Police Department and the Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation. The trafficker used drugs, alcohol, physical violence and intimidation to control his victims. He plead guilty to four counts of trafficking in persons, three counts of promoting prostitution, two counts of rape, two counts of compelling prostitution, one count of endangering children, and one count of having weapons under disability. The trafficker was sentenced to 13 years in prison.

The second person convicted under Ohio law was arrested by the Westlake Police Department in January 2014 after a sting operation was conducted. The police department received a tip that a woman advertising herself online as a prostitute was working for her pimp in exchange for heroin. On October 2, 2014, the trafficker was convicted of one count of trafficking in persons, one count of compelling prostitution, and three counts of promoting prostitution. He was sentenced to 10-19 years in prison.

The third person convicted under Ohio law was arrested in May 2014 by the Cuyahoga County Sheriff's Office in an undercover sting after the family of one of his victims reported her missing. He was a known heroin dealer and ran a prostitution ring out of his home where he forced the woman he trafficked to stay. The victims ranged in age from 19-29 and were advertised online. He used increasingly higher dosages of heroin to control his victims.

In December 2014, he plead guilty in court and was convicted of one count of trafficking in persons. The judge sentenced him to 10-15 years in prison.

Law enforcement agencies further reported the numbers of potential victims, traffickers, and buyers/johns they identified over the past year. The human trafficking victims who most often came to the attention of law enforcement over the past year were young, white adults who were victims of sex trafficking. 181 potential victims of human trafficking were identified, with 147 being female and 34 being male. Of the potential victims, four were aged 12 and under, 12 were aged 14-15 years old, 23 were aged 16-17 years old, 71 were aged 18-20 years old, 50 were aged 21-29 years old, and 11 were aged 30-40 years old. 10 of the potential victims did not have an age listed. 105 victims were identified as white, 66 victims were listed as black, there were no victims listed as Asian/Pacific Islander or American Indian/Native Alaskan, and two of the potential victims did not have an ethnicity listed.

Though the majority of the suspected cases were sex trafficking, law enforcement did identify eight potential labor trafficking victims. Of the potential labor trafficking victims, four were identified as white, three were identified as black, and three did not list an ethnicity. One of the potential victims was aged 14-15 years old, four were aged 16-17 years old, two were aged 18-20 years old, and one was aged 30-40 years old.

Over the past year, law enforcement identified 113 suspected traffickers total, including 111 potential sex traffickers and two potential labor traffickers. 65 were identified as black and 44 were identified as white, with four traffickers having no ethnicity identified. Of the potential offenders identified, two were aged 16-17 years old, six were aged 18-20 years old, 54 were aged 21-29 years old, 28 were aged 30-40 years old, 12 were aged 41-59 years old, and two were aged 60-84. Nine of the potential traffickers had no age listed. Of the potential traffickers, 69 were identified as male, 26 were identified as female, and 18 did not identify a gender.

The number of suspected buyers/johns identified by law enforcement in 2014 was 68, the vast majority of which were identified as potential consumers of sex trafficking (67). 51 consumers were identified as white, 14 identified as black, one identified as Asian/Pacific Islander, none identified as American Indian/Native Alaskan, and two did not list an ethnicity. Only 46 potential consumers had an age listed. The one potential labor consumer was identified as 16-17 years old. One potential consumer of sex trafficking was aged 16-17 years old, eight were aged 21-29 years old, 24 were aged 30-40 years old, 10 were aged 41-59 years old, and two were aged 60-84 years old. 65 were identified as males, none were identified as females, and three did not identify a gender.

Trafficking can involve movement of victims across cities, states or the country. Law enforcement identified motor vehicles as the method of transportation in 64 cases and one

case identified an airplane as the method of transportation. In three cases, law enforcement listed the method of transportation as “other” than motor vehicle, airplane or watercraft. In two cases, the method of transportation was listed as “non-applicable,” which most likely means that the case did not involve known transportation.

Finally, law enforcement agencies were asked to categorize the social and/or economic factors leading the victim to be trafficked. In nine cases, law enforcement identified the underlying risk factor as “runaway and homeless youth.” In four cases, “truancy” was listed as a risk factor. The majority of cases that reported risk factors identified “drug/alcohol/other dependency” (45 cases). It is unclear when the dependency began, before the suspected trafficking or during. 10 cases listed “oppressed, marginalized, and/or impoverished” as an identified risk factor and seven cases listed “other factors.”

More law enforcement officers are conducting human trafficking investigations and identifying more potential traffickers and trafficking victims in Ohio than ever recorded before. While only several traffickers were successfully convicted under Ohio law, the data reveals a substantial increase in reported potential cases. This shows a much greater sense of awareness amongst law enforcement officials, which is a positive step towards stopping human trafficking in Ohio.

Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force

The Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force was created by the Ohio Organized Crime Investigations Commission as a law enforcement collaborative to investigate human trafficking cases in the Central Ohio area. The Task Force was announced in August 2012 and is primarily composed of those with the Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI), the Columbus Police Department, the Powell Police Department, the Delaware County Sheriff’s Office, Homeland Security Investigations, the Ohio State Highway Patrol, the US Attorney’s Office for the Southern District of Ohio, and the Delaware County Prosecutor’s Office in partnership with the Salvation Army of Central Ohio.

The Central Ohio Human Trafficking Task Force provides victim-centered law enforcement efforts throughout the central Ohio area to combat human trafficking. In 2014, the Task Force referred 67 potential victims to social services, rescued 17 potential victims, received and processed 149 human trafficking-related tips, and successfully obtained seven criminal convictions against potential offenders.

Law Enforcement Training

Attorney General DeWine’s Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy (OPOTA) actively trains local law enforcement to identify and investigate cases of human trafficking in Ohio. The Ohio

Peace Officer Training Commission implemented the “Missing and Human Trafficking” course as a part of the basic training curriculum in response to The Safe Harbor Law, which requires all new Peace Officers to receive human trafficking training. This will ensure that all law enforcement officers are armed with awareness about human trafficking and tools on how to investigate these crimes.

In 2014, a total of 4,975 Ohio Peace Officers took part in and completed human trafficking training through the Ohio Peace Officers Training Academy. Out of this total, 2,548 were new Peace Officers who completed the human trafficking course as a part of their basic training. 2,399 current Peace Officers completed the human trafficking course made available through eOPOTA, the Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy’s online classroom. And 28 officers completed in person human trafficking training at the OPOTA training facility. The public can view these online courses by visiting www.OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov/HumanTrafficking under the “Online Human Trafficking Training” tab.

Conclusion

In 2014, Ohio made great strides in the fight against human trafficking. The professionals who serve victims and survivors of trafficking every day have continued their work through the Human Trafficking Commission and many other groups and coalitions across the state. Law enforcement identified more potential cases last year than ever and reported helping more victims gain access to the appropriate services. Through continued awareness and education, Ohio will work towards providing better supports for victims and survivors of trafficking as well as identifying and convicting more traffickers.



Ohio Attorney General's Office
Human Trafficking

2014
Annual Report

For more information:

**Ohio Attorney General's Office
Programs and Development
30 E. Broad St., 17th floor
Columbus, OH 43215**

614-728-7275

www.OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov



MIKE DEWINE

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

www.OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov